Rapid Processing of Both Reward Probability and Reward Uncertainty in the Human Anterior Cingulate Cortex

Rongjun Yu^{1,2}, Wu Zhou³, Xiaolin Zhou^{2,4}*

1 Department of Psychology, South China Normal University, Guangzhou, China, 2 Department of Psychology and Center for Brain and Cognitive Sciences, Peking University, Beijing, China, 3 Departments of Otolaryngology and Communicative Sciences, Neurology and Anatomy, University of Mississippi Medical Center, Jackson, Mississippi, United States of America, 4 Key Laboratory of Machine Perception, Ministry of Education, Peking University, Beijing, China

Abstract

Reward probability and uncertainty are two fundamental parameters of decision making. Whereas reward probability indicates the prospect of winning, reward uncertainty, measured as the variance of probability, indicates the degree of risk. Several lines of evidence have suggested that the anterior cingulate cortex (ACC) plays an important role in reward processing. What is lacking is a quantitative analysis of the encoding of reward probability and uncertainty in the human ACC. In this study, we addressed this issue by analyzing the feedback-related negativity (FRN), an event-related potential (ERP) component that reflects the ACC activity, in a simple gambling task in which reward probability and uncertainty were parametrically manipulated through predicting cues. Results showed that at the outcome evaluation phase, while both win and loss-related FRN amplitudes increased as the probability of win or loss decreased, only the win-related FRN was modulated by reward uncertainty. This study demonstrates the rapid encoding of reward probability and uncertainty in the human ACC and offers new insights into the functions of the ACC.

Citation: Yu R, Zhou W, Zhou X (2011) Rapid Processing of Both Reward Probability and Reward Uncertainty in the Human Anterior Cingulate Cortex. PLoS ONE 6(12): e29633. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0029633

Editor: Jason Jeremy Sinclair Barton, University of British Columbia, Canada

Received April 30, 2011; Accepted December 2, 2011; Published December 27, 2011

Copyright: © 2011 Yu et al. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Funding: This study was supported by grants from the Natural Science Foundation of China (60435010, 30770712). The funders had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.

A

(*.

Competing Interests: The authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

* E-mail: xz104@pku.edu.cn

Introduction

R	4.		- 1	•
	•	4 N	۲ ۲	• 1,2 .
		. 4.		-
· · · · ·	- 1 - 1		• . I [']	-
	-			
- 1	 • •	, _	1	
3 16 1	5.T	 	د د	
	4 1 (• •		(•••
, ,	,		•	. (*
F- 41) F 1. (2003)		• . I	· ì ,
R N	IRI •			• •
4.			 	• 6,7 .
Т	· · · ·	(ACC)	• J	• 1
	1	 -	.E - 1	1
(ERP)		E	RP	, N
It	T FRN,	(FRN), • • • •		- - -

- 1	ŀ	1 1	١	· , ·	1¢1 -
÷	ACC 8	10 . C			, MRI
- ACC	2			· · · ACC	1
	L	11,12.	А	MRI	1
ACC		Í			
£		મે			
1 -		1		· · ·	· 1 13.
	ACC		ĥ		· · ·
ТΙ	• ERP			FRN	1-
	ACC -			 	1 -
£			4.		
CC. A				1 1	
4. 14					- 1
	,		4.	- 75	% 100%
1		4	*	1	
100%	•	•) C)		
4	L.	25%	0%	ì	
4.	1	10.10	0.10	· (• 0%	
•) T					
4 5	0% A	50%			4.
- 0	1	50%			4.
, G-	-				1 -
		4.		· · ·	- , \
	4.	-	0	100% I	
	4.		0	100 /0.1	· · ·
	4.			•	, ,
	•				

Image: Product of the second se

Materials and Methods

Participants

S-			(8)	Ι;		22 ± 2.5
)			1-		. Т	1
,			1-	વે		
	1		1-			
40	(US \$6).	· , ·			۰. ۲
		· · ,				
А	• C	£	D	Р	۱	Ъų.
U -	•					

Experimental design

ŕ 4 11 14 16 (F· . 1). I 1 Ŕ ۱ 2 p 10. ۱ Т ŕ · 3000 . ۱ • 0.5 . A 0.5 1. . 1 1 . . \mathbf{P} p , ۱ ۱, ۱ 0.5 4 . . 3000 .A 700 . 11) 1000 . T 4. 2 10, . 4 0, 0.125, 0.25, 0.375,



Figure 1. Illustration of events and timing in a single trial. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0029633.g001

0.5, 0.675, 0.75, 0.875, · I. P · · 1, 1. . 1 . 4. . .A 700 +50" -50"1000 0.5 ۱ 0.5) 1 - 1 1 ۱ . p ۱ ۱ Ŕ - 1 Ŀ.Т p . 1000 - 1 1 16 Т 96 - 1 9 . F 96 • 1 . . , ۱ 11 - 1 4. 1 ۱, ۱ . F 3, 12.5% n² - 1 ۱ 87.5% **Й**. Т ŵ - 1 ۱ 1 6. F 4 Т 1. IJ P = 0.5۱ . . ۱ P = 01. I 14,16 . T 4. 0, ۱ 4. 0.44, 0.75, 0.94, 1, 0.94, 0.75, 0.44 0 0, 0.125, 0.25, 0.375, 0.5, 0.625, 0.75, 0.875 1, 1 **I** (T **I** 1). 14,16 . U ۰ <u>-</u> ۱ 4 • 4 . ŀ • . A ŕ ۱ . 4. 1 . 1. . ŕ 11 4. 1 ۱ Т 1 1). T . . 0 ۱). A ANO A 9 ۱ ۱ ۱ ۱. FRN ŀ . 4 ۱ . R ANO A ۱ FRN ŀ . . . 1. ۱ 4. . S-۱ $\mathbf{P} = 0$ P = 14 ۱ P = 0.5, ۱ . . ۱ . FRN ŀ . D G G۰ Μ . ۱ - 1 . N ۱ 4 ANO Α n. 1 4 ANO А ۱, 1. 1 n 4 n. (. 4 FRN ۱. S-۱

ERP recording and analysis

EEC	j.				64	1	*	•	•	1	
		1	•					Ι	•	1	10/20
	(N	S	Ι	. H	,			, USA)	. Т		-
	1				•	۱	5	ΚΩ. Ε]	1	
		1			- 1			- 1	1		. T
	11	-	1		(EOG)					1	
1	1.5	١	١		Ì				1		· All

Table 1. The win probability and uncertainty for each of the nine conditions at the cue phrase and the reward prediction error and uncertainty prediction error associated with win and loss outcomes.

Cue phase				Actual wins in the outcome phase			Actual losses in the outcome phase		
Cue number	Win probability	Uncertainty	FRN amplitude	Positive PE	Uncertainty PE	FRN amplitude	Negative PE	Uncertainty PE	FRN amplitude
2	0	0	-1.859	N/A	N/A	N/A	0	0	-1.252
3	0.125	0.438	-1.785	0.875	0.438	-2.696	0.125	0.438	-0.854
4	0.25	0.75	-2.346	0.75	0.75	-1.907	0.25	0.75	-0.743
5	0.375	0.938	-1.749	0.625	0.938	-0.807	0.375	0.938	-1.487
6	0.5	1	-1.985	0.5	1	-0.532	0.5	1	-2.617
7	0.625	0.938	-1.876	0.375	0.938	-0.044	0.625	0.938	-3.27
8	0.75	0.75	-1.641	0.25	0.75	-0.743	0.75	0.75	-3.943
9	0.875	0.438	-1.667	0.125	0.438	-0.838	0.875	0.438	-4.232
10	1	0	-0.889	0	0	-1.338	N/A	N/A	N/A

Grand mean FRN amplitudes (μV) during the interval 275-325 ms post-cue across participants are also presented. PE=prediction error. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0029633.t001

۱ ۱ ۱ ۱ Т EOG EEG 4 (0.05~70 H), . n¹ ۱ 500 H -1-۱ Ο ۱ (G l., 1983). All $+/-70 \mu$ EEG ۱ • . T ۱ EEG 1-16 ŀ ۱ 50% 1. 1. . ι T EEG . ۱ ŀ 4 2~20 H (24 В 11). T · ۱ FRN . . . ERP P300, . . ŕ ERP P300 · ۱ ۱ . ۱ 17,18 . E 800 . 200 ۱ ŀ) EEG ۱ ۱ . .

ŕ

F , ۱ ۱ (1 1 275 325 ۱ ٠), . 19,20. Т . ۱ ۱ FRN, ۱ FRN ŀ 1 250 325 FRN ۱ ۱ Т 4 . 1 ۱ . FRN ŀ 4 ۱ FRN 21,22 . T 4 FRN, ŀ FRN ŀ (• 4. ۱ . ۱

FRN

.

Dipole Analysis

А

ŀ

ERP ۱ ŀ ۱ А Т f ERP n ۱ ERP 11 ERP Т ۱ **F**1 n ŵ ERP

۱ . S ŀ (BESA, В . E١ S ۱ . А 5.0)11 11-۱ I. A 23. - 1 4 (2 H) ۱ 1. . . ۱ . 4 14 ERP F 75 125, 150 200, 250 350 ۱ 1. ۱ . N1, P2, FRN ۱ . 1 1 P21. ۱ N1۱ . 11 1 . T ۱ 0 350 -11 ERP

Results

Cue-evoked FRN

Ŵ F FRN -1 ۱ 275 325 _ ۱ F-91 ۱ 1 . 2A), ANO A · $(\mathbf{T}$ 4. . ۱ 4. , F(1,15) F(8,120) = 3.57, p = 0.016,= 5.33, p = 0.036,11 F(1,15) = 3.28, P = 0.09. F ŕ FRN · . ۱ ANO A 275 325 4 ۱ . 4. , F(8,120) = 5.874, p = 0.001, . . , F(1,15) = 3.977, p = . ŀ 0.065, , F(1,15) = 10.657, p =. . 0.005. T ۱ FRN 4 11 4 FRN . ŀ 11 1 ۱ R 1 FRN ۱ ŀ . . (**B** ۱) 4. 0.745 ± 0.24 -0.556±0.21. T ۱ ۱ . (t = 3.08, p =0.022 4. t = -2.64, p = 0.038), . ŕ FRN ۱

4 Т FRN 11 ۱ ŀ 4. .



Figure 2. Grand-average ERP waveforms from channel *Fz*. ERPS were time locked to (A) the cue phase, (B) win outcome condition, and (C) loss outcome condition. Please note, the outcome probability used in this figure refers to the actual outcome frequency. Thus low probability indicates that the outcome is infrequent. For example, 25% probability in win condition refers to 'actual win after the prediction of 25% winning probability', whereas 25% probability in loss condition refers to 'actual loss after the prediction of 75% winning probability'. For clarity, only waveforms for probabilities of 25%, 50%, 75%, and 100% are presented. The topographic map of mean FRN at 300ms in the cue, win, and loss conditions were also shown. (D) Coding of reward probability and reward uncertainty in cue-evoked FRN, and (E) outcome-evoked FRN. The regression lines were computed based on the regression equations for each condition. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0029633.g002

(F. 2D). T $R^2 = 0.73, p = 0.019.$ N 1 1. 1 P = 1**p**. P = 1. 1 -FRN 4. (P >0.05). ۱ l 250 325 F . (T **l** 2), ۱ **4 · ·** (0.565±0.26) (-0.789 ± 0.23) . . . 4., (=2.17, =0.073)= -3.33, = 0.014•). T ۱ I FRN 1 275 325 -

Outcome-evoked FRN

ANO A · (·/****) 81 1 4. . 1 ۱ F(1,15) = 16.39, P = 0.001,4. F(7,105) = 12.91, P < 0.001,. . . . ۱ 4. , F(7,105) = 5.37, P = 0.002, 4. FRN ŀ ۱ .

Table 2. The win probability and uncertainty for each of the nine conditions at the cue phrase.

Cue number	Winning probability	Uncertainty	FRN amplitude
2	0	0	-1.859
3	0.125	0.438	-1.785
4	0.25	0.75	-2.346
5	0.375	0.938	-1.749
6	0.5	1	-1.985
7	0.625	0.938	-1.876
8	0.75	0.75	-1.641
9	0.875	0.438	-1.667
10	1	0	-0.889

Grand mean FRN amplitudes (μ V) during the interval 250–325 ms post-cue across participants are also presented.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0029633.t002

F • • - j ۱ , F(1,15) = 32.90, P < 0.001, . . L , F(1,15) = 7.56, P = 0.015, - př FRN 4. . 1.C . ANO A 1. ŕ 1 4 ۱ FRN (F. 2B) ۰. . . . ۱ ۱ . . t(7) = -8.20. . *p*<0.001, , t(7) = 7.89, p = 0.001, . . . -2.596 ± 0.32 2.234 ± 0.28 - 1 . (F. 2E, -۱ . N ۱ . . Т . .). . . FRN ŀ ĥ . . FRN ŀ ۱ Т ۱ ۱ R^2 = 0.947, p = 0.001.· · - j Ι ۱ ۱ , F(1,15) = 9.71, P = 0.007, . . 1 . . , F(1,15) = 2.94, P = 0.107, ۱ . FRN 4. . I ۱۰, . ANO A 1 ۱ p FRN (F[•] . 2C) . . . ۱ ۱ . . , t(7) = 7.70, p = 0.001, . -4.795 ± 0.62 , $1.011 \pm 0.56, t(7) = 1.81, = 0.130$). T $R^2 = 0.93,$. 1. ۱ . p = 0.001 (F·. 2E, ·). N . . . ŕ FRN, p FRN ۱ -

p^r - FRN · ·

Source analysis of the FRN

Ι . . 1. ۰ <u>-</u> ۱ , ۱ 4.86% (F. . 3A) ŕ FRN . ACC _ ۱ (=10, =5, =37). I 1. ۱ 0 350 _ ŕ . 4.85% ĥ FRN . _ = -2,= 37). T ACC (=5,۱ ERP . ۱ 4.74%, ۱ (F. 3B). T ERP . ACC -۱ ۱ 4. ۱. .

Discussion

I FRN, ACC ۱ 4 ۱ . p . . ۱ ۱ ACC. O ۱ p FRN 4 4 ۱ _ l FRN 4., ŀ ۱ FRN ۱ ۰. ۱ FRN ۱ _ ۱ • . T ۱ p. ACC · . .



Figure 3. Sagittal, transversal, and coronal views of dipoles. Dipoles were superimposed on MRI-based head models for grandaverage ERP waveforms in (A) cue phase and (B) outcome (win/loss) phase.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0029633.g003

P · ERP ·	•		
4· • ACC. T		l	
4. 1 (* 259	% 50%	75%)	- 1
	ло, 5070, Эс. т	1070)	-
	20.1 EDN	1	
	FKN	1.	
	4		
4-1 1	+_ IF	FRN,	۱ -
🕅 FRN 25,			4.
1	🖗 FRN	1 -	🖗 FRN
26 T			n
]	±	£	£
	, . .		, , ,
ACC. F.	4		1 1
		μ.	
· · · · · T	•		- 1
• 1 •			-
- 1 - 27.28	3.S.		4.
£ £	4	· · ·	
	19.5%	0 100%	\
• (12.370	0 10070)
			· ·
1	£		1 -
- 1 - P	FRN N.	د	
4			•
- 4 1	ACC. T ·		n
- ACC	 		
<u> </u>	 L L		· ·
	20.30		
L EDM	29,50	J. I EDM	
FKIN		FKIN	1
		ACC	29,30;
· · · ·	• •	• •	•
· · · · FRN	ŀ	•	
		FRN	ŀ,
· 1 29,30 . T			
ACC ·· · 1	1	FRN 1-	Т
	- 1 h.		• •
		1	1
	ACC		•
MFRN I	4 1-	1 •	
· · ·	FRN	l	• •
• • • ERI	2 22	,24,31 33 ,	ŀ
··· I FRI	V 1-	·) (
N)	- 1		
	⊮ 1.	. ,	
	. . Т		
	. 1 N 1		
	TN T		•

۱ 34.F ŵ 1 -1 - 1 **.** . 1 1 FRN 34 . . Ο ŀ FRN ŀ 1 -4 - 1 ۱ ŀ • 1 FRN 35. T p¹ . ۱ . ACC . . ۱ 36 38 . T 🖡

ACC N - 1 p . 34. Т . . p FRN FRN. _ p. U . - 1 . . 1 1.D. 1 4, ACC. T · 4 ۱ . ŀ. ۱ p FRN 1. . pł. . . T • FRN ۱ . ۱ ۱ . . Т ۱ ۱ MRI 1. ACC 15 . T . . Т 1 . ۱ . I , 1 FRN (*. ., ŀ Ο ۱ ACC 1 4 13.ТЙ ACC · S . F٠ - 1 4 - 1 FRN Η FRN 20 -1 (10 . . ۱. 39, - 1 1

. . ۱ FRN ŀ . S ۱

References

- Н, М 🦻 · НМ (1979) А 4. 1. L . . 2. R I LA (1991) A I • R • 69: 308 317. 1 .
- 3. S
- 4. F• 41 CD, T 1 PN, S 1 (2003) D• 4 . . S • 299: 1898 1902. 5. T 1 PN, O'D
- JP, DI RJ, SI (2007) R · 1 97: 1621 1632. - 1 . . . JΝ
- AR, S D, Cl F J, M C, Gl F MA, **l** (2004) H 6. A 1 ... • . ۱۰.JN · 1 92: 1144 1152.
- P, B KF (2006) N ۱ 7. D JC, K
- 16: 561 573. 8. G J, -11 AR (2002) T
- 1 . S · 295: 2279 2282.

4 1 1. Μ ۱ 1. ۱ . 1 40,41 .

34. H 4. . 4.... 1 1 Т . FRN ŀ . T ۱ ۱ FRN . ŕ /ACC ۱ . I • ۱ . . FRN · . Al , . . FRN . FRN · F ۱ 1 , ۱ . F FRN ۱ ŀ 1-14 ACC 8,42,43, \mathbf{ACC} FRN FRN. I ۱ 44,45 . T - 1 ۱ ۱ . ۱ (. . ACC), 1 1 FRN 1 46.I · - 1 1 ACC 45. F-1 4 FRN 1. ۱ - 1 , **F** . 21,47 49.T 1 FRN ŀ ۱ 1 . . . ۱ FRN. G-• • • • • FRN · 1 · (PCA) 49.0 FRN · ۱ ŀ . ۱ ŀ 1. Ι 4. - 1 1. 300 ACC ۱ . A 4 ۱

۱ 1 . 1 FRN ۱ . C ŵ ۱. ACC.

Author Contributions

. \mathbf{C} . . P : R . : R . A 1 : R . C 1 -1/1 - 1:R. : R

- , н і CB, C JD, S 9. A, C CS (2004) E h : h : h : h. B · C 56: 267 276. - 1
- CH, C \ MGH (1997) E 10. M4 HR, B - 1 - 1 Ê∲:E -11 -۱ • .JC Ν 788 798.
- J (2008) E 11. R M ET, M C C, R , p, 4. . 1 -
- ۱C \mathbf{C} 18:652 663. 12. J RK, B JR, B
- J (2010) E 14 1-· 30: 3467 3472. •.JN
- ∙м, 13. B TE, ME, R MF (2007) L 1.N N ۱ · 10: 1214 1221.
- К, В SR (2006) N 14. P P, Q 1 -. . . N - 1
- 51: 381 390. 15. C • • • HD, M • CJ, D • RJ (2001) N · · · . N - 1 -۱ 29:537 545.